



Regional Workshop on Travel and International Tourism Consumption
Roseau, Dominica
14-17 May, 2013
Final Report and Recommendations of the Meeting

Opening

1. Opening statements were made by Prayma Carrette, Chief Statistician of Central Statistical Office of Dominica, by Dr. Philomen Harrison of the Caribbean Community (CARICOM), and Karoly Kovacs, Chief of the International Trade In Services Statistics Section of the UN Statistics Division (UNSD). Ms. Carrette welcomed the participants of the workshop to Dominica and introduced the launch of her office's Trade in Services Report. She also summarized other advances of her office, including the reporting of quarterly GDP and high frequency indicators.

2. CARICOM welcomed the participants and stressed the importance of travel for the region, stating that travel accounts for 72% of total exports of the region. CARICOM also highlighted the fact that more data are being made available and at higher frequency by the regional statistical offices. CARICOM also reiterated that travel and tourism should be viewed as a portion of the broader System of National Accounts and that CARICOM's work is always grounded in the National Accounts.

3. UNSD explained that the workshop is part of the programme of support to developing countries by UNSD and others for the implementation of the revised international recommendations for statistics of international trade in services contained in MSITS 2010 and on tourism statistics contained in IRTS 2008 and TSA: RMF 2008. Moreover, this workshop is a follow up of the workshop organized for the CARICOM countries a year ago focusing on international trade in services and the creative industries hosted by the Central Statistical Office of Barbados which was organized by WTO.

4. UNSD also expressed appreciation to the Government of the Commonwealth of Dominica and especially to Ms. Carrette and her staff at the Central Statistical Office for their support to make this workshop a success. UNSD highlighted the work of international organizations; namely the organization of a Global Forum on Trade Statistics in February 2011 by UNSD and the Statistical Office of the European Communities (Eurostat), which has made explicit demands to improve the relevance of international trade statistics by connecting and integrating it with other economic statistics and also urged closer cooperation among the national agencies involved in the compilation and dissemination of international trade statistics to realize those improvements. Moreover, he emphasized the importance of the proposal made at this year's Statistical Commission to start work on a new umbrella framework which will bring together the areas of international trade in goods and services, foreign affiliates

statistics, foreign direct investment, outsourcing of business functions, manufacturing services, global production, and trade in value-added. Also mentioned was the international effort led by UNSD to develop a Compilers Guide for MSITS 2010 (of which a first draft should be available in late 2013), which should give practical compilation guidance to all those statisticians working in national statistical offices, central banks or ministries who have responsibilities in collecting, compiling or disseminating trade in service statistics.

5. UNSD concluded by reinforcing the stated goals of this workshop, which are to explain the updated recommendations of MSITS 2010, IRTS 2008 and TSA: RMF 2008 to discuss the specific compilation issues, and for countries to share their experiences in the compilation of travel and tourism statistics. He also introduced the three resource persons in attendance, namely Marion Libreros Pinot for UN World Tourism Organization (UNWTO), Barbara D'Andrea of World Trade Organization (WTO), Demi Kotsovos of Statistics Canada, representatives from CARICOM, the Eastern Caribbean Central Bank (ECCB), and the Caribbean Tourism Organization (CTO).

6. CTO presented key policy issues in the region it sees affecting tourism. CTO stressed that the Caribbean is the most tourism-intensive region in the world, and that tourism accounts for 14% of GDP of the region and for 12% of employment in 2012. CTO highlighted key policy concerns, including inadequate measurement that leads to an understatement of the economic activity of tourism. Also highlighted was sparse availability of key performance indicators (e.g., accommodation occupancy rate and length of stay) and the fact that, in the region, Tourism Satellite Accounts (TSAs) are only employed in the Bahamas, Jamaica, and the Dominican Republic. Other policy issues cited were the importance of environmental sustainability, safety and security as it relates to tourism, the fact that tourism is seen as a lucrative tax revenue source, and the high cost of intra-regional air travel.

7. CTO also presented its statistical inventory and data sources, which include immigration card or emigration/disembarkation card (E/D), and hotel registration data, Visitor Expenditure and Motivational surveys. CTO's statistics are from 32 Caribbean destinations and include data on the number of visitor arrivals, profiles of visitor (demographics), activities of visitors, expenditures, accommodation statistics, and economic data. CTO also highlighted that the timeliness of statistics varies from country to country and that accommodation data and visitor expenditure estimates are non-existent in many countries. CTO announced its following initiatives: developing a TVS index; collaboration with IDB to promote TSAs in member countries; improving CTO's data management; and developing data transfers from immigration records.

8. Marion Libreros of UNWTO presented an overview of the International Recommendations on Tourism Statistics (IRTS 2008), particularly focusing on stressing the differences between travel and tourism. UNWTO presented the actual definition of tourism as "the activities of travellers taking trips to a main destination outside their usual environment for less than one year for any main purpose (business, leisure and other personal) other than to be employed by a resident entity in the place visited". UNWTO further presented the historical development of tourism statistics, dating back from 1937 to the publication of IRTS 2008. UNWTO then presented the

structure and table of contents of the IRTS 2008 and reviewed the main differences between concepts in the IRTS 2008 from previous recommendations, including improved definitions of tourism trips and visits; clarification regarding being employed by a resident unit in the place visited; revised formulation of the definition of the different forms of tourism; review of the definition of tourism expenditure and tourism consumption; and employment in the tourism industries, among others.

9. WTO presented an overview of the new Manual of Statistics of International Trade in Services (MSITS 2010). WTO reviewed in-depth the important concepts of the General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS) 4 modes of supply of trade in services; namely 1) Mode 1: “cross-border”; 2) Mode 2: “consumption abroad”; 3) Mode 3: “commercial presence”; and 4) Mode 4: “presence of natural persons”. WTO explained the need for a revised MSITS, including incorporation of BPM6, SNA 2008 revisions (ISIC Rev.4 and CPC Rev. 2); need for guidance on measuring the modes of supply; and new recommendation on foreign affiliates (FATS). WTO also reviewed in-depth transactions of services between residents and non-residents; the main services components; and the Extended Balance of Payments 2010 (EBOPS 2010), which is a product-based classification that is consistent with and more detailed than 12 BPM6 services components. WTO also explained that the MSITS 2010 provides a table of correspondence between EBOPS 2010 and the GATS list of services. WTO then also reviewed in-depth the concepts of FATS statistics. WTO concluded by listing the core recommendations of the MSITS 2010, including: implementing BPM6; compiling EBOPS 2010; collecting complete foreign direct investment (FDI) statistics; compiling basis FATS variables; allocating services to the modes of supply; and collecting the number of natural persons under GATS framework.

10. WTO presented the conclusions from the 2012 WTO/CARICOM Workshop on Statistics of International Trade in Services with a special focus on Creative Industries held in Barbados in which countries were encouraged to design a regional approach to measure and analyze activities in the creative industries sector (including a regional statistical framework). WTO highlighted key challenges in collecting statistics on the creative industries, including confidentiality issues, the number of small units reflecting its informal sector nature; reluctance of respondents; and lack of copyright enforcement, among others. WTO explained that MSITS 2010 and EBOPS 2010 are the appropriate statistical frameworks and to also use the 2009 UNESCO framework. WTO stressed that CARICOM needs to define classifications for the Caribbean region beyond international guidelines. WTO also stressed the importance of building appropriate business registers; exploiting existing sources; drawing on experiences of others organizations; and building institutional arrangements; building capacity. WTO concluded by asking participants where they stand now in the implementation of these recommendations.

11. In response to WTO’s question on the status of implementation of the recommendations from the 2012 WTO/CARICOM workshop on the creative industries, the Bahamas reported that it has a business register that it has updated, but that it has run into roadblocks with compiling FATS. The Bahamas has added FATS questions to establishment surveys. The Central Bank of the Bahamas was trying to move to BPM6 but it hasn’t been fully implemented yet. Jamaica reported that it is very difficult to get creative industries on business registers, in part because the life spans of creative industries are sometimes very short. Trinidad and Tobago reported

that substantial work has been done on business registers, but that most creative industries are not getting captured in formal data collection. Trinidad and Tobago has worked with agencies that know about these industries and with formal agencies (e.g., ministries of cultural development).

12. CARICOM reported that it is working on the classification for the creative industries and is working to finalize them, and that they are currently receiving policy attention at the regional level.

13. CARICOM reported that she hopes the CG MSITS 2010 includes developing countries' perspective and experiences. UNSD stated that the Task Force has 11 developing countries and we have contacted developing countries for experiences and surveys. UNSD noted that even developed countries don't have much experience yet with MSITS 2010 since it's still fairly new.

14. WTO presented the proposal to amend EBOPS 2010 to enhance the measure of cultural services in the Caribbean. In particular, WTO presented the alternative classifications for travel (i.e., by purpose of travel or by products consumed); classifications for charges for the use intellectual property, n.i.e., with a focus on the reproduction and distribution of music, which is important for the Caribbean region; and classifications for personal, cultural and recreational services, with a focus on items of importance to the region, including music, movies, carnivals, festivals, concerts abroad, and heritage services.

Travel and Tourism statistics - Policy needs

15. UNSD presented an overview of the Compilers Guide for MSITS 2010 (CG MSITS 2010); namely, its background, scope, and aim, which is to provide practical advice, good country examples and pitfalls (to be avoided) in the implementation of MSITS 2010. UNSD stressed that the CG MSITS 2010 should be useful for both developed and developing countries and should reflect practices for all regions of the world. UNSD reviewed the formation of the Expert Group (EG), which includes all members of the Task Force on SITS and has been tasked with the drafting of the CG. UNSD summarized the results of a call for comments on the annotated outline of the CG in a World-Wide Consultation, which received input from 50 countries, indicating the broad appeal and interest in the CG. UNSD stressed the CG will be internally consistent with BPM6 and IRTS 2008. UNSD then reviewed the outline and table of contents of the CG. UNSD stated that it is seeking country practices from a wide range of countries to include in the CG and has thus far received submissions from 22 countries. UNSD concluded with the current status of the drafting and editing process; namely, a face-to-face meeting of the EG in Geneva in June to discuss current drafts, with a full draft text expected by the end of 2013; and the presentation of the CG MSITS 2010 to the UN Statistical Commission in 2014.

16. CARICOM expressed the hope that the CG MSITS 2010 includes developing countries' perspective and experiences.

17. UNSD responded to CARICOM's comment above by stating that the Task Force has 11 developing countries and that several developing countries have been contacted for experiences and surveys. UNSD also noted that even developed

countries do not have much experience yet with the MSITS 2010 recommendations since they are still so new.

18. UNWTO presented an overview of the Compilation Guide for IRTS 2008 (CG IRTS 2008), which is still in progress but is in its final stage. UNWTO reviewed the structure of the CG, which follows the same structure as the IRTS 2008, including sections on Demand, Classifications, and Supply of Tourism. UNWTO presented the conceptual background of the key issues presented in the CG and reviewed basic concepts used in tourism statistics, including the demand perspective; measuring flows and characteristics of tourism trips and visitors; measuring tourism expenditure; classifications in tourism statistics, and measuring supply of tourism industries. UNWTO also highlighted that a model questionnaire for inbound tourism has been proposed.

19. UNSD presented an overview of its UN Service Trade Database, which was launched in 2007 and contains statistics on resident to non-resident trade in services between (all or nearly all) the countries of the world. UNSD reviewed its annual data collection procedure that begins in July each year and the data requirements that are asked directly of national statistical offices and central banks, when possible, and otherwise obtained from other international organizations. UNSD presented its data validation process and stated that it does not estimate missing values and that it presents metadata when submitted by countries. UNSD presented a sample page of the database, which is user-friendly and similar to the format of the UN COMTRADE database. UNSD reported that the UN Service Trade Database covers approximately 90% of global trade in services. UNSD then presented future improvements it is planning, including increasing the number of data sets received directly from countries; improving data quality by improving internal data processing; getting more partner breakdown than the current 42 countries reporting bilateral data; providing more metadata and improving functionality of the database. UNSD concluded by presenting a snapshot of EBOPS data EBOPS (and the travel component in particular) it has collected on from countries in the CARICOM region from 2001 to 2012.

20. Bermuda requested UNSD to make its annual data request in January rather than July so that offices would have more time to prepare the data requested. In response, UNSD stated that it would coordinate with CARICOM to facilitate the data collection process.

21. UNWTO presented the basic concepts and the relationship between travel and international tourism, including the definition of tourism and international tourism; the scope of tourism expenditure; the categories of tourism expenditure/consumption; the relationship between visitors, their venue and tourism consumption; the definition of travel; and the relationship between travel and tourism expenditure/consumption. UNWTO also reviewed the details of measuring flows of travellers/visitors and on the type of information needed to be collected, including demographic data, country of nationality, country of residence, date of arrival, duration of trip, purpose of trip, and form of accommodation. UNWTO also stressed that the frequency of observation is an important topic that needs to be established as a statistical operation. UNWTO also presented an overview of the difference in persons involved in tourism (e.g., diplomats, border workers, crews, students, etc) and their different types of

expenditures; international passenger transport; and operations of tour operators and travel agencies.

Travel and Tourism Data Compilation

22. UNWTO presented concepts of data compilation of travel versus international tourism. UNWTO presented the recommended general procedures of measuring the both Travel and International Tourism. UNWTO also reviewed the differences in the definitions of travel and tourism, and how sometimes the differences in the two datasets are not that different, whereas in other countries the differences can be quite significant. UNWTO then reviewed in-depth that the estimation of travel and tourism expenditure/consumption will usually be developed in two phases: 1) the estimation of the flows of travellers/visitors and some basic characteristics that determine expenditure, using a mix of administrative data and statistical observations; and 2) the estimation of average expenditure per person per day to be applied to numbers estimated in Phase 1 using statistical observations. UNWTO reviewed the data sources that can be used, including E/D cards, data from airlines, specifically designed surveys, and other possible sources.

23. UNWTO also presented specific advice on estimating total expenditures; namely, UNWTO stated that total expenditure is obtained by multiplying flows by average length of stay by average expenditure per person per day. When the compiler controls by type of accommodation and by length of trip, the compiler will get better estimations of average expenditure per day. UNWTO explained that total expenditures include airline travel but are added to the total, not included in the calculation for average expenditure per day, which is calculated separately. Additional difficulties arise when a third party is paying for the expense (normally for business travel).

24. UNWTO also encouraged that there is Increasing international experience in the design of questionnaires used for tourism. UNWTO distributed a model questionnaire that it is recommending as a reference. The questionnaire should not be used right away as-is, but must be reviewed and critiqued and applied/clarified for each country's particular experience.

25. Suriname presented its experience in estimating the travel component of the balance of payments, including an overview of its methodology and data sources, relation to the transportation account, adjustments made for the travel component, and data issues. Its data sources include ITRS (which has an 8-day lag), Surveys, Customs, Money Transfer Houses, Debt Management Office, Monetary Statistics, and other direct reports (including Ministry of Finance). Suriname reported that its ITRS introduced electronic reporting in 2011, which was a huge improvement and they are working on adjusting the figures from 2005 forward so that they are comparable. Suriname also reported it is recognizing the growing importance of tourism. It also reported that additional sources that are not yet used include travel surveys to the 3 most important hotels; however, these surveys result in lower flows than the ITRS. Tourism statistics rely solely on incoming immigration forms and the Suriname reports that the statistical office is collaborating with the Foundation of Tourism in Suriname to receive further information concerning travel (e.g., total incoming tourist/

destiny, length of stay and accommodation). Suriname also reported that it needs to create awareness in how to fill out surveys in the tourism sector.

26. Trinidad & Tobago presented an overview of its estimates of resident/non-resident flows of trade in services. It reported that the statistical office utilizes Surveys of Foreign Visitors, which are applied to total departing travellers, to estimate expenditures of non-resident travellers. It also reported that it uses surveys to shipping agents and foreign airlines for advances to crews; returns from commercial banks for estimates for business travellers; and data from the Comptroller of Accounts for transactions of government officials. Trinidad & Tobago also reported that it is working towards moving to BPM6 and covering FATS.

27. St. Kitts and Nevis presented an overview of measuring residents and visitor travel. It reported that surveys and administrative data are its existing data sources. It also reported that while it does not currently publish tourism statistics, some of the indicators available include monthly visitors by type (e.g., excursionist, tourist, cruise and yacht; Stay-overs; Country of Residence; Purpose of visit; Type of accommodation; and Average Length of Stay. It also reported that it derives a partial estimate for travel using an equation of Average expenditure (x) average length of stay (x) Visitor Arrivals by type.) For imports of travel, it reported that a benchmark estimate is used from the Household Expenditure Survey. Additional data sources St. Kitts and Nevis reported include bi-annual visitor expenditure surveys conducted by the tourism authority and data from the Hotel and Tourism Association.

28. Dominica presented an overview of inbound tourism, domestic tourism, and outbound tourism. It reported that the Ministry of Agriculture conducts surveys at domestic tourist sites and that a survey is conducted at hotels and restaurants on agricultural purchases. It also reported that it will have an additional survey piloting this summer. Also, Dominica stated that it plans to work with taxi drivers so the survey can be filled out on travellers' way to/from the one international airport.

29. The Dominica Director of Tourism reported that Dominica has targeted the type of visitor to Dominica: adventure-seeker, nature loving, and frequent international traveller. The tourism authority has targeted marketing to those types of travellers, rather than using a broad approach, partly due to limited funds but also to most effectively reach potential visitor. It also reported that most stay-over arrivals to Dominica are from the French West Indies (29%), followed by US (24%), and the rest of Caribbean (8%).

30. The ECCB presented an overview of institutional arrangements and the statistical department's core functions in the region. It stated that it facilitates effective and efficient statistical systems and that it is currently revising BOP surveys to be compliant with BPM6. It reported that it meet with NSOs bi-annually and has good relationship with other agencies as well. ECCB is coordinating with the OECS Secretariat to coordinate the work program. It reported that it is also working toward a fully integrated web-based interactive Statistical Enterprise Solutions for collection, processing and dissemination. The test case for this new system will be Suriname.

31. UNWTO presented information on the data compilation details of travel and tourism consumption, focusing on the particularities of the observation, sampling and

grossing up, issues that need to be considered when using and creating questionnaires, the issue of packages and their unbundling, and the issue of international transport. On the issue of packages in particular, UNWTO reported that there is no clear procedure for unbundling them and the various methods depend on the availability of information, the cooperation of tour operators working in the country, and the relative importance of the phenomenon in the country.

32. Guyana presented an overview of tourism data sources and its visitor exit survey (VEM). It reported that the Migration Database and the VEM are its main data sources. The Migration Database provides information on the arrival and departure of visitors by way of air, road and water travel to and from Guyana. It reported that it does not currently collect from other possible sources, such as taxis and hotels. Guyana stated that the Bureau of Statistics has trained enumerators stationed at the Cheddi Jagan International Airport to conduct the VEMS with travellers from most departing flights on a daily basis. The VEMS captures purpose of visit, travel companion, travel arrangement, types of accommodation, modes of payment, activities undertaken and attractions visited, and other variables.

33. St. Vincent and the Grenadines presented on the challenges and difficulties faced when compiling travel and tourism statistics. It first reported that it is very challenging to calculate the Hotel Industry's contribution to GVA given the very low response rate to survey and lack of administrative data. It also reported that timeliness of the reports from the data sources is a challenge. St. Vincent and the Grenadines also states that reports from the Immigration Department are challenging due to manual compilation of passenger statistics and the fact that there are several ports of entry, which creates additional delays. It also reported that its future plans include enhancing the procedures for data collection and data entry.

34. UNWTO presented the main classifications used in tourism statistics, including providing a list of tourism characteristic products/tourism characteristic activities, examples of equivalence with CPC ver. 2 and ISIC rev 4, and reviewing the coverage of activities corresponding to each category. UNWTO also stressed the importance of classifications in statistics and provided general recommendations.

35. Montserrat presented classifications of tourism purposes. It first reviewed defining the main purpose of a tourism trip and the importance of classifying. Montserrat also presented the two broad main classifications of trips: namely, personal and business, and also presented more in-depth on more specific classifications, such as visiting family, education, health expenditures, religious purposes, and transit, among others. It also reported on the challenges of classification, including limited understanding of the concepts on behalf of Immigration Officials and respondents and non-responses, among others.

36. UNWTO then presented on measuring the supply of tourism industries and reviewed the list of tourism characteristic activities. UNWTO stressed the importance of measuring accommodation providers because consumption by visitors of the supply of accommodation services in an economy is often around 90-95% and consumption of accommodation services by visitors represents an important share of total tourism consumption (20%). UNWTO reviewed the two main types of accommodation providers: namely, providers operating within the formal, organized

economy and smaller-scale and occasional providers. UNWTO also reported that it offers Software for Measuring Accommodation Services free of charge, which makes it possible to generate very easily those indicators at the level of each establishment of the survey, and to combine these observations to obtain data at aggregated level, on a monthly basis. This accommodation kit includes sections on Identification, Capacity (rooms/beds), Employment, Total wages and salaries, and Revenues/turn-over. In UNWTO's experience in Africa and Eastern Europe, hotels were happy to fill out the questionnaire in the accommodation kit in order to compare themselves against the aggregated industry. UNWTO explained that the philosophy should be to request the data from the hotels and also at the same time give the hotels the last month's aggregate total.

37. St. Lucia presented on sources that can be used to measure the supply of accommodation services. It presented an overview of St. Lucia's accommodation offerings and the type of data collected, including Occupancy, Average Daily Rate, Bed nights available & bed nights sold Employment data, Utility consumption / expenditure, Payments to Treasury and Revenue information on niche services. It also reported that ideally the primary source of data is an economic survey of hotels, even though these may be difficult to obtain and have low response rates. It reported it also utilizes E/D cards and exit Surveys that provide information on number of tourists at hotels. St. Lucia also provided an overview of secondary sources and issues affecting data supply, including Reliability / Consistency, Coverage, Timeliness, Confidentiality, and Cost, among others.

38. Trinidad & Tobago presented an overview of the defining of accommodation service providers as it is done according to the International Standard Industrial Classification (ISIC) of All Economic Activities (Rev 3.1). Trinidad & Tobago also reviewed more in-depth its classification of its industry classification for Hotels and Guesthouses, which is comprised of sub-categories covering different sized establishments within the categories of Hotels, Self-Contained Apartments, Condominiums, Guesthouses, Bed and Breakfast Establishments, Hotel-Bars, Hostels and Camping Facilities.

39. UNWTO provided guidance on measuring employment in tourism statistics. It reviewed the IRTS recommendations and the particular features of employment in the tourism industries, including the presence of seasonal employment, the supply of jobs for untrained persons, individuals filling different positions at different moments of the day, unpaid family-workers, the high frequency of part-time work, and the treatment of outsourced activities. UNWTO also covered methods of observation and sensitivity of the results to the definition of tourism activities.

40. The Bahamas then presented its experience in measuring employment in the tourism industries. It reported that its statistics are consistent with the recommended methodological framework for tables 1-6, with the tourism industries being represented including accommodations, food and beverage serving industry, passenger transport (road, water, air), travel agencies, sports and recreation, real estate, and casinos, among others. It reported that its source for most of these statistics is the Labour Force Survey, but that for some of the Tourism Industries the Labour Force numbers are adjusted by the portion of that Industry that represents Tourism. Its

future plans for improvement include expanding the Business Establishment Register to get more details on numbers of employees.

41. Belize gave a presentation on the classifications of occupations. It reported that its main sources for data on occupations is the Census and the Labour Force Survey (LFS) and classifies occupations in the Tourism industry by type of occupation and industry worked. It reported that the Census only asks about main job only and the LFS asks about main and other jobs. It reviewed some of the main questions on the LFS and also covered the topic of single vs. multiple job holders and obtaining data by economic activity as well according to the Belize Classification of Economic Activities. Belize also cited other data sources, including hotels, tour operators and administrative records, among others.

42. Montserrat gave a presentation on data quality in tourism statistics, covering the definition of quality, and key attributes, such as accuracy, timeliness, completeness, relevance, accessibility, adequacy of documentation, and coherency. It also identified causes of poor data quality, including technical aspects, such as inaccurate measuring or counting device, errors in the data storage process, and missing data fields, as well as aspects of human error caused by unintentional errors in data entry and poor training, and organizational issues in terms of merging databases. Montserrat also touched on some of the effects of poor data quality. In particular for Montserrat, it reported that data on visitor length of stay is a problem area.

43. Belize gave a presentation on metadata, which provided an overview of the definition of metadata, as well as its importance and benefit. The metadata for tourism statistics is not currently presented on the Belize Tourism Board's website. It reported that some of the tables on tourism data are sent to the Statistical Institute of Belize (SIB) for publication in the annual Abstract of Statistics and to the Central Bank of Belize (CBB) for compilation of the Balance of Payments and that SIB are currently building a new website to include different forms of metadata. The metadata includes a list of files for users to access regarding the input, processing and out put of data. As well as structures and formulas used in producing the data.

44. UNSD then presented an overview of the guidelines on data quality assessment, metadata, and dissemination. It reviewed the key features of data quality, including relevance of statistical concepts, accuracy, timeliness, accessibility and clarity of information, comparability of statistics, coherence, completeness/coverage, and cost and burden. UNSD also presented examples of quality assessment frameworks, including the European Statistical System, the IMF Data Quality Assessment Framework (DQAF), and OECD Quality Measurement Framework. UNSD also reported that the minimum two levels of recommended metadata are structural (e.g., footnotes explaining the statistical output) and reference metadata (e.g. a description of data sources and statistical processes and estimations related to producing the statistics). UNSD also covered key topics in building a dissemination policy and the different forms of dissemination, including traditional means, multimedia, and internet. It also reviewed UNSD's mission to develop and promote global statistical standards and to collect, analyse and disseminate social, economic, political and environment statistical data at country, regional and global level.

Tourism Satellite Accounts

45. Statistics Canada gave a presentation on the concepts and definitions of tourism expenditure and tourism consumption in terms of the tourism satellite accounts (TSAs). It reviewed the goal of the TSA, which is to measure the economic activity of tourism respecting both the System of National Accounts and the TSA: Recommended Methodological Framework (TSA RMF). It also reviewed basic concepts, including “usual environment”, types of tourism trips, duration and main purpose of trip, and employment. Statistics Canada then explained in-depth the measurement framework and what is included and excluded from “tourism expenditure” and “tourism consumption”.

46. Statistics Canada then presented the concepts of Tourism Gross Fixed Capital Formation and Tourism Collective Consumption. It presented the definition of gross fixed capital formation as the total value of a producer’s acquisitions, less disposals, of fixed assets during the accounting period plus certain additions to the value of non-produced assets realized by the productive activity of institutional units. It reviewed how to measure gross fixed capital formation according to the TSA RMF as well as the challenges and limitations inherent in the RMF and provided practical examples from the Canadian experience. Statistics Canada also reviewed the concept of Tourism Collective Consumption. Statistics Canada stressed that statistical compilers usually do not know the data quality or where the weaknesses are in the TSAs until they start collecting the data from all the sources and analyzing them and actually starting attempting to create a TSA--that is when compilers encounter the issues.

47. Bermuda presented on its experience in compiling TSAs. It reviewed its data sources, which include tax receipts, data from the national accounts, business establishment surveys, visitor exit surveys, household expenditure, and the balance of payments. It also presented the data it presents in its 10 TSA tables, including inbound tourism consumption, domestic tourism expenditure, outbound tourism consumption, internal tourism consumption, employment in the tourism industries, tourism gross fixed capital formation, collective consumption, and nonmonetary indicators.

48. Statistics Canada presented an overview of the concepts and definitions of reconciling supply and demand of the TSAs and reconciliation with the national accounts. It reviewed the concepts of tourism supply and why it is important, the measurement framework of tourism supply and demand, and basic concepts of tourism characteristic industries, tourism single-purpose consumer durables, and travel agent commissions.

49. UNWTO gave a presentation on the process of reconciling supply and demand in the TSA. UNWTO reviewed the importance of setting up a TSA, how to constructing a TSA from basic information, the data transformation process, and adjusting the format of the Supply and Use table. It also provided a numerical example to illustrate these concepts.

50. The Bahamas gave a presentation on its experience with the TSAs in reconciling supply and demand and integration with the National Accounts. It first reviewed its first attempts to create a TSA and the data sources used, which included BOP, External Trade Statistics, Ministry of Tourism Exit Survey, Expenditure Survey. The

Bahamas reported that the lack of a supply and use table made it more difficult to reconcile the data. It then reported on its second attempt at creating a TSA, with the help of Statistics Canada. It created Supply and Use tables in 2005 and 2007. The Use and Demand Sheets of the Bahamas include the original estimates by Industry and Final Use and adjusted final values by Industry are also listed. These adjustments are reportedly as a result of the demand of commodity balancing with the corresponding supply. It then reported how it was able to identify tourism industries and tourism characteristic products and the specific issues it faced when reconciling supply and demand for particular industries, including accommodation providers, beverages served on premises, meals outside the home, land transportation, and casinos. Based on its experience, the Bahamas concluded that a TSA can be calculated using the same data found in the Supply and Use tables; however, having the Supply and Use tables facilitated the reconciliation of Tourism Supply and Demand.

FDI and FATS in the tourism industries

51. WTO gave a presentation on the link between FDI and FATS statistic and Tourism. It presented an overview of how FDI and FATS statistics can address questions about globalization, such as to what extent the economy controlled by foreigners and what are the characteristics of foreign affiliates compared to national firms. It presented in-depth examples of FDI and FATS transactors and the different types of flows of involved. WTO also reviewed in-depth the concepts of inward and outward FATS, as well as adding questions to cover the basic FATS variables on FDI surveys and FATS-specific surveys.

Group Discussions

52. The participants broke into four groups and discussed the data sources used by each of their offices to compile tourism expenditure and other tourism statistics. These sources included visitor exit surveys, E/D cards, immigration records, household surveys, business establishment surveys, administrative data from the Port Authority, and hotel surveys, among others. Groups also discussed the level of collaboration among the different organizations involved in compiling tourism statistics in their countries. Collaboration among agencies was widely reported among the participants; however, in some cases the agencies were not aware of the others' specific methodologies and definitions.

53. The participants also presented issues and challenges facing them in the process of compiling tourism statistics. These challenges included reluctance from stakeholders to provide data, not having capacity or resources to collect the data, not using recommended methodological frameworks, differing interest from organizations that collect and compile data, data gaps, absence of supply and use tables, insufficient collaboration among compiling agencies, and insufficient awareness among compiling agencies of definitions and methodologies.

54. UNWTO presented some concluding thoughts and questions; namely it reiterated the importance that travel and tourism are *not* the same. Moreover, UNWTO questioned how quarterly travel estimates are reconciled with tourism data. Participants' responses included the following: that travel estimates in some countries

are compiled annually from the Visitor Expenditure survey and that separate institutions are collecting and producing the different sets of data (e.g., central bank for travel component of balance of payments and statistical office for visitor expenditures). ECCB reported that compiling the balance of payments is a joint exercise between it and the individual central banks or statistical offices. It reported that ECCB creates an estimate for travel and tourism expenditures if these are not supplied by the country and that often these figures are the same. ECCB reported that its estimate for tourism expenditure is based on flows of visitors times average daily expenditure, which is an estimate. CARICOM reported that efforts are being made to coordinate between CARICOM and ECCB.

Concluding Remarks

55. Dr. Harrison of CARICOM presented concluding remarks. CARICOM recognized the International and Regional agencies and their representatives that collaborated in organizing and facilitating the conduct of the workshop on Travel and International Tourism Consumption. These included: the United Nations Statistics Division (UNSD); the World Tourism Organisation (UNWTO), the World Trade Organisation (WTO); Statistics Canada; the Caribbean Regional Technical Assistance Centre (CARTAC); the Caribbean Tourism Organisation (CTO), the Eastern Caribbean Central Bank (ECCB) and the Caribbean Community (CARICOM) Secretariat. The facilitators all presented at a very high level.

56. CARICOM also recognized the contribution of the participants from Member States and Associate Members (Bermuda and Cayman Islands) whose contributions were of a very high quality and formed the basis of a rich exchange and interaction of experiences and best practices, contributing to the overall knowledge base of the topics of the workshop.

57. CARICOM further recognized that the workshop represented part of a wider program of strengthening statistical capacity in the Region for both the UNSD and the CARICOM Secretariat. In January 2013 in Jamaica there was a workshop organized by the UNSD, CARICOM Secretariat, and ECLAC in partnership with Statistics Canada, CARTAC and the ECCB on the Implementation of the System of National Accounts 2008 (2008 SNA). The workshop on Travel and International Tourism Consumption is located within the framework of the 2008 SNA implementation support.

58. CARICOM acknowledged the quality of presentations by the facilitators and noted that the concepts were well articulated and that member countries benefitted from the exposure to these concepts.

59. CARICOM noted that one of the core messages coming from the workshop was that travel is not equivalent to tourism and underscored the need to understand the conceptual differences in the measurement of both transactions in accordance with the internationally recommended standards.

60. CARICOM further noted the presentation on the “Creative industries Classification Proposals” which was discussed previously at the workshop on Culture and Creative industries that was held in 2012 co-organized by the WTO and the

CARICOM Secretariat in collaboration with the UNSD and the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO), World Intellectual Property Rights Organization (WIPO), the Shridath Ramphal Centre, UWI and other agencies. The CARICOM Secretariat is to follow-up the draft of the proposed classifications with countries.

61. CARICOM recognized that though the Tourism Satellite Account (TSA) would not be developed in a short time frame, given its intensive nature, feasible steps can be taken to facilitate the process of developing the TSA in the respective countries within realistic timelines with support from the regional and international agencies and the collective inter-agency mechanism at the national level.

62. CARICOM emphasized that continued investment is required to strengthen basic data sources for statistics in core areas such as the System of National Accounts (SNA) including the Supply and Use tables (SUT) and GDP by Expenditure in Constant and Current Prices; Visitor Expenditure Surveys; Balance of Payments (BOP); Trade in Services (TIS) including Modes of Supply/Movement of Persons and Foreign Direct Investment (FDI) and Foreign Affiliate Statistics (FATS).

63. CARICOM also emphasized that the TSA needs to be built upon sound quality statistics grounded in the core areas of statistics mentioned in item 8; that data gaps need to be identified and filled; and that the corresponding international standards and manuals need to be utilized in the process of developing the TSA.

64. CARICOM further emphasized that the components of all the areas of statistics indicated under Item 8 should not be viewed in isolation; linkages should be instituted with regard to the data sources of the National Accounts and the other areas and the development of the TSA in contrast to the use of models that may not rely on these sources of data and therefore which would not have any linkages with the National Accounts and supporting statistics.

65. CARICOM emphasized to the participants on the importance of collaboration, citing that it was necessary to know how the Central Banks calculated the travel component of the BOP; the reconciliation of the SUT tables with the GDP by the National Statistical Offices (NSO); and the compilation of the FDI and FATS. It was also important that all users and producers of the data are aware of the international manuals and methodologies used to ensure that the data produced are sound and internationally comparable.

66. CARICOM recommended the use of a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) in setting the basis of Inter-Agency Coordination and collaboration in countries. Both the NSOs and the Central Banks have a role to play in terms of training of stakeholders and on informing them of their roles in compiling statistics on Travel and International Tourism Consumption.

67. CARICOM also emphasized the need for international organizations to better coordinate their activities given the capacity constraints of small countries. This should take into consideration the workload such as Census and the International Comparison Programme, (ICP) and other such demanding activities.

68. CARICOM further emphasized the importance of a proper and effective approach to the documentation of the metadata such as explanations, on how the data were computed and the approach to the sampling design; the conduct of the survey; the derivation of estimates and the treatment of outliers. Metadata production and the assessment and the documentation of the quality of the data on Travel and Tourism are to be encouraged.

69. CARICOM expressed appreciation for the continued support of the UNSD, the WTO, Statistics Canada, the ECCB and CARTAC and also recognized the support provided by the European Union (EU) through the Tenth (10th) European Development Fund (EDF) in National Accounts, Merchandise Trade and Trade in Services Statistics being executed by the CARICOM Secretariat.

70. CARICOM commended the Member States of Belize and Montserrat for their presentations on data quality and noted that this item is foremost on the regional statistical agenda.

71. CARICOM also expressed appreciation for the support and representation from the Member States and Associate Members (Bermuda and Cayman Islands).

72. CARICOM encouraged participants, on their return to their respective countries, to share the knowledge gained at the workshop with their national stakeholders so as to maximize the added-value through their exposure to the rich information obtained from the workshop.

73. CARICOM applauded the efforts of Dominica, for being the first country in the region to produce a national publication on *Statistics on International Trade in Services*, a copy of the report having been circulated to each participant.

74. UNSD thanked colleagues from UNWTO, WTO, Stat Canada, from international perspective, and thanked the regional organizations. UNSD stated that it looks forward to greater collaboration between CARICOM and ECCB. UNSD gave extra thanks to Dominica and the Central Statistical Office for hosting the event.

75. Participants thanked all of the organizers of the event for an intense but productive workshop and for addressing the difficult questions. They also thanked Dominica for hosting the event.

76. Prayma Carrette of the Central Statistical Office of Dominica gave final closing remarks.

Annex 1 **Recommendations of the Workshop**

Improve coordination among national agencies and regional and international organizations

1. It is recommended that institutional arrangements be strengthened among the various national agencies responsible for compiling travel and tourism statistics is recommended, as while these agencies may already be in communication with one another, they are often unaware of each others' methodologies and definitions.
2. It is recommended that national statistical agencies establish Advisory Committees and create memorandums of understanding with sister organizations involved in the compilation of travel and tourism statistics in order to support the sustainability of cooperation, often informal, between the relevant agencies..
3. It is recommended that there is greater coordination between regional organizations, especially CARICOM Secretariat, the ECCB, and CTO, in coordinating data collection efforts in the region and promoting the compilation of TSAs. Moreover, further collaboration among international organizations and regional organizations and national agencies is recommended, in order to provide adequate capacity building opportunities and technical assistance.
4. It is recommended regional organizations play a coordination role in harmonizing the work program for the region.

Identification of the basic data sources including already existing official sources

5. It is recommended that agencies responsible for compiling travel and tourism statistics create an inventory of existing data sources to ensure that they are internally and mutually consistent and reliable across agencies within the respective countries and across countries.
6. It is also recommended to identify existing data sources in order to determine data gaps in the compilation of travel and tourism statistics.

Review of the methodologies used in the data collection, processing and estimation procedures of Visitor Expenditure Surveys

7. It is recommended that national agencies responsible for compiling travel and tourism statistics review their existing surveys and add and/or revise questions as needed in order to collect travel and tourism data in accordance with the international methodological frameworks.
8. It is recommended that Visitor Exit Surveys are improved in order to collect higher quality and more timely data, as well as greater data coverage.
9. It is recommended, in order to deal with non-responses and/or unwillingness by respondents to fill out surveys, that increased efforts are taken to train survey takers, erect signage at key locations informing visitors about key concepts and definitions on the survey, and/or hire more staff to conduct surveys.

Follow-up actions on classifications used in the creative industries and preparation of the data collection of international trade in services in this field

10. It is recommended that CARICOM Secretariat continues to work towards finalizing the classifications for the cultural/creative industries which was initiated at the workshop held in May 2012 for the CARICOM countries.
11. It is recommended that CARICOM Secretariat helps coordinate countries' efforts to implement recommendations on the collection of trade data on cultural/creative services and establishing an appropriate business register.
12. It is recommended that CARCIOM Secretariat coordinates with UNSD in order to facilitate the process of collecting and disseminating international trade in services statistics in this area.

Business registers

13. It is recommended that national statistical offices create, maintain, and update business registers, which are very useful tools in creating travel and tourism statistics and TSAs.

Work with stakeholders

14. It is recommended that national agencies responsible for compiling travel and tourism statistics collaborate with high-level stakeholders (including policy makers, tourism boards, tourism industry associations, etc.) to discuss the importance of and need for higher quality travel and tourism statistics in order to place the issue higher on their agendas and to be in a better position to request funding for these projects.

Implement common definitions for “travel” and “tourism”

15. It is recommended that agencies responsible for compiling travel and tourism statistics move to better understanding and implementing the current international recommended definitions and frameworks for the “travel” and “tourism” concepts.

Create metadata processes

16. It is recommended that agencies responsible for compiling travel and tourism statistics create standard procedures for creating and disseminating metadata, which will aid in educating and raising awareness of travel and tourism concepts.

Capacity Building

17. It is recommended that the regional and international organizations provide more technical assistance in this area.

Phased implementation approach towards TSAs

18. It is recommended that agencies responsible for creating TSAs implement a phased approach towards building and improving TSAs, as this work is intensive and takes time.